Teaching and Learning Through Reflective Practice

Dr. Karen V. Mann
Professor, Division of Medical Education
May 12th, 2010

Session Objectives

1. To understand the existing research and evidence about reflection
2. To identify teaching and learning strategies that reflect the evidence
3. To discuss issues that enable and hinder teaching and assessing reflection
4. To consider potential strategies to use in promoting reflection in our home settings
Agenda for today

- Introductions
- Overview of evidence and literature about reflection and reflective practice
- Questions and discussion.

Reflection and Reflective Practice

- What do you see as the benefits of reflection and reflective practice for learners?
- for practicing professionals?
- for your patients?
Definition

- Reflection has been defined as “a generic term for those intellectual and affective activities in which individuals engage to explore their experiences in order to lead to a new understanding and appreciation.”


Definition 2 - Reflection

- “Systematic and critical evaluation and analysis of actions and beliefs and the assumptions that underlie them”. Driessen, van Tartwijk, Dornan, BMJ, 2008; Dewey J, *How we think*, 1933

- “Critical reflection” or “critical thinking”.
Reflection as Integral to Competence

Competence

...The habitual and judicious use of communication, knowledge, technical skills, clinical reasoning, emotions, values and reflection in daily practice for the benefit of individuals and communities being served.

Epstein and Hundert, 2002.

Models of Reflection: Boud, Keogh & Walker

Behaviour

Ideas

Feelings

Returning to experience
• Utilizing positive feelings
• Removing obstructing feelings
• Re-evaluating experience

Experience(s)

Reflective processes

Outcomes

New perspectives on experience
Change in behaviour
Readiness for application
Commitment to action

The reflection process in context

(Boud, Keogh and Walker, 1985.)
Models of Reflection: Schön

Knowing-in-action

Reflection-on-action

Surprise

Experimentation

Reflection-in-action

Schön, 1987

Models of Reflection: Moon

New material

Assimilated

Cognitive structure guides learning

Stages of Learning
Transformative
Working with meaning
Making meaning
Making sense
Noticing

Deep learning

Surface learning

Moon, 1999.
Concrete experience

Testing implications of concepts in new situations

Observations and reflections

Formation of abstract concepts and generalizations

Kolb’s Experiential Learning Cycle

Models of Reflection

- Originate in different fields of study
- Generally depict an iterative process
- Some delineate different levels of reflection
- Deeper levels more difficult to achieve
- Few are explicit about role of emotions
Levels of Reflection

1. Thinking and acting on an everyday basis
2. Specific reflection of incidents or events
3. Development of understanding through interpretation (personal experience and that of others)
4. Reflection on how we reflect (mindfulness) (Van Manen, 1991.)

Discussion – Principal elements of reflection

- How does the theory and evidence for reflection influence our thinking about reflection in teaching and learning?
- From the models, what might be the principal elements of reflective learning?
Questions?

Potential Benefits of Reflection

- Improved practice
- Development of self regulation
- Facilitation and integration of theory and practice
- Development of personal theories of practice
What Does the Literature Tell Us About Reflection?

- What do we know?
  - Professionals engage in reflective practice
  - It is not a unitary phenomenon
  - It serves several purposes
  - Reflective thinking occurs in students

- It can be measured and classified
- It appears to be developed through practice and supervision
- Reflective practice appears linked to learning and development
- It is enabled or hindered by certain factors
More recent work...

- Reflection appears to be instrumental in self-assessment (Sargeant, Mann et al, 2009)
- Facilitated reflection appeared to enable performance feedback acceptance (Sargeant, Mann, et al, 2008)
- Residents exhibited reflection in their learning in the workplace (Teunissen et al, 2007)
- Reflection in action “knowing when to slow down” (Moulton et al, 2007)
- High-scoring physicians used reflection in daily practice (Sargeant, Mann, et al 2006)
- Reflective approaches to diagnosis may reduce error in solving complex problems (Mamede and Schmidt, 2008)

More recent work - scales

The Self-reflection and Insight Scale (SRIS)

The Groningen Reflection Ability Scale

The Reflection in Learning Scale
Strategies for Teaching and Learning through Reflection

- Journals
- Critical Incidents
- Portfolios
- Role models – modeling reflection
- Facilitating reflection
- Providing feedback on reflection

What Conditions Enhance Reflection?
What are the Challenges to Reflection?

Who Should Reflect?

- Learners
- Teachers
- Individually
- Collectively with peers and faculty

(Frankford, 2000)
(Coulehan, 2005)
What to Reflect Upon?

- Seminal events
- Personal experiences
- Personal beliefs and values
- Interactions with patients
- Interactions with colleagues
- Learning gains and needs
- Observations

What to Reflect Upon?

- Overall impressions
- What went well
- What they were thinking
- Any new goals that emerged
- Any assumptions or biases
- What they were feeling
- What others were feeling

(Weisberg and Jason, 2001)
Reflection

- Helps to uncover our assumptions and premises- a kind of ‘white noise’
- Reveals gaps between Knowing-in-action and espoused values
- Helps to make tacit values explicit
  
  (Haidet and Stein, 2006)
  (Argyris and Schön, 1974)

When to Reflect? Examples?

- Before an experience (anticipatory reflection)
- During an experience (reflection-in-action)
- Following experience (reflection-on-action)

  (Westberg and Jason, 2001)
Shared Reflection

- Continuity
- Trust
- Peer Support
- An opportunity to reframe

(Branch 2006)

Finding the Hidden and Informal Curriculum

- Understanding the institutional environment and organizational culture
- Better understanding the premises (Haidet & Stein, 2005)
- Reflections - students and faculty (Gaiser, 2009; Phillips, 2009)
- Student narratives (Karnieli-Miller et al., 2010)
- Student portfolios
Potential Negative Effects of Reflection

Potential Negative Outcomes

- Busy work
- Lack of impact
- Rejection by students
- Misplaced confidence

Boud & Walker, 1998

Potential Negative Effects of Reflection (Cont’d.)

- Poor practice in reflection
  - Recipe following
  - Reflection without learning
  - Intellectualizing reflection
  - Inappropriate disclosure

Boud & Walker, 1998
Potential Benefits of Reflection

Potential Positive Outcomes
- Promotion of deep learning
- Increased awareness
- Improved thoughtfulness before and during practice

Reflection
- Allows bridging theory and practice
- Helps to understand the broader context of practice
- Helps to relate one’s learning over time, or to others
The Iceberg of Professional Practice

References


References


References


References
